

Health Scrutiny Committee

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday, 12 October 2022

Present: Councillor Green – in the Chair

Councillors: Nasrin Ali, Appleby, Bayunu, Curley, Karney, McHale, Newman, Reeves, Riasat, Richards and Russell

Also present:

Councillor T. Robinson, Executive Member for Healthy Manchester and Adult Social Care

Councillor White, Executive Member for Employment and Development

Professor Sir Michael Marmot, Institute of Health Equity (virtually)

Andrew Maloney, Deputy Chief Executive, Greater Manchester Mental Health NHS Foundation Trust

Guy Cresswell, Executive Director, Great Places Housing Group (virtually)

HSC/22/97 Minutes

Decision

To approve the minutes of the meeting held on 7 September 2022 as a correct record.

HSC/22/98 Making Manchester Fairer: Tackling Health Inequalities in Manchester 2022-2027

The Committee considered the report of the Director of Public Health that provided an update on the work of the Making Manchester Fairer Task Group.

Key points and themes in the report included:

- Making Manchester Fairer 2022-27 described the actions that the city would take to reduce inequalities, with a focus on the social determinants of health;
- The Making Manchester Fairer Action Plan would be launched for staff within the wider population health system at The Making Manchester Fairer Conference on Monday 31 October 2022;
- The final version would be accompanied by a communications campaign;
- Providing a summary of themes, plans and key actions;
- Information on the Kickstarters, four schemes that could be implemented quickly to give the plan momentum;
- Information on the Making Manchester Fairer Task Group and Network, noting that they would have oversight of the collective development and delivery of the plan;
- The agreed mechanism to undertake the evaluation and monitoring of the plan;
- The approach to workforce engagement;
- The approach to resident and community involvement; and

- Providing a selection of case studies.

Some of the key points that arose from the Committee's discussions were: -

- Welcoming the report and recognising the important work that was being delivered on behalf of the residents of the city to address health inequalities;
- Condemning the Government for failing to address health inequalities;
- Calling for a coalition of voices, hosted in Manchester to challenge the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care on this issue;
- Noting that in New Zealand, the Prime Minister had challenged all policy makers to address health and wellbeing in all their decision making;
- Welcoming the inclusion of businesses in the work to address health inequalities and recognising the relationship between good employment and health outcomes; and
- Noting the good work provided by the Voluntary Community and Social Enterprise sector, however noting that they would need to be supported to change and adapt to the cost-of-living crisis.

The Committee heard from Professor Sir Michael Marmot, Institute of Health Equity. He reiterated the stark health outcomes and inequalities experienced by Manchester residents and how Covid had exacerbated and further highlighted these. He stated that health inequalities had been subject to three significant factors, namely austerity, the pandemic and now the cost-of-living crisis. He stated that currently there was no indication from government that they were seeking to address health inequalities and were following ideological economic policies rather than the overwhelming evidence, adding that this was ultimately dangerous for the health of the population.

Professor Sir Michael Marmot commented on the progress and approach adopted in Manchester adding that this experience was used as an exemplar model, and that other regions, particularly in the North East were keen to develop similar plans to address health inequalities. He said that as more regions adopted this evidence-based model it would provide leverage to persuade the government to engage seriously on this issue. He stated that he would support the call for a coalition of voices that brought together all partners and different regions to then invite the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care to listen to the case for addressing health inequalities. He suggested this could involve the Mayor of Greater Manchester and the Universities.

Professor Sir Michael Marmot welcomed the insightful contribution from the Deputy Director of Public Health to recent discussions at an Advisory Board on the issue of structural racism. He stated that this Board had provided a clear steer for the need for a detailed understanding of this issue, and the importance of doing this 'with' communities affected by racism.

In response to comments raised by a Member in regard to health inequalities experienced by older residents, he acknowledged this and stated that he fully supported any activity to address this. He commented that it was evidenced that social isolation was as harmful to health outcomes as smoking cigarettes. In response to a Member's comment regarding the impact of damp homes on people's health, particularly respiratory conditions, Professor Sir Michael Marmot stated that

this was understood. He added that the Institute of Health Equity had recently published a report entitled 'Fuel Poverty, Cold Homes and Health Inequalities in the UK'.

Professor Sir Michael Marmot advised that the Health Equity Network had recently been launched that had been hosted by the University of Manchester. He described that this network sought to bring businesses, in partnership with the Public Sector, Health and the Voluntary Community and Social Enterprise sector into the discussion and actions to address health inequalities. He stated that the three domains that the Network would consider were in relation to Good Employment, including pay and conditions; Goods and Services and the impact of Anchor Institutions. He stated that Legal & General had joined the Health Equity Network which was a very positive development. He advised that the work and outcomes of this network would be assessed and reported.

The Deputy Director of Public Health discussed the importance of tackling structural discrimination and racism. She stated that this could only be achieved through meaningful commitment, collaboration and coordination across all systems. She reiterated the importance of involving all communities and all voices, noting that this would include those that were traditionally regarded as being overtly challenging or difficult. She stated that it was recognised that a 'one size fits all' approach was not appropriate and bespoke and appropriate engagement would be required. She stated that it was important to establish trusted relationships and dialogue with communities acknowledging their lived experience of racism. She said these conversations and listening would be assisted by connecting through trusted community networks and neighbourhood teams, using a Community Development approach. She stated this would build on the lessons learnt from the Winning Hearts and Minds activities and the work of Covid Health Equity Manchester that arose in response to the pandemic. The Director of Public Health commented that the lessons learnt and experience of delivering the vaccination programme would also help inform this approach to community engagement.

The Deputy Director of Public Health acknowledged the comment raised regarding older people and advised that the final plan would include a specific element regarding the life course, that included older people.

The Director of Public Health advised that the Plan was a system wide plan that involved all Council Departments, including housing.

The Executive Member for Healthy Manchester and Adult Social Care paid tribute to the Director and the Deputy Director of Public Health and all staff involved in producing the report. He further welcomed the Members' ongoing challenge and scrutiny of this important area of work. He further commented that GP's were now included as members of the Provider Collaborative Board and the issue of fair work was included on the Board's agenda for discussion. He stated that addressing health inequalities was central to the work of health and social care integration in Manchester. He further paid tribute and appreciation to Professor Sir Michael Marmot for his continued support and contribution to the work of the city.

The Chair in closing this item of business thanked Professor Sir Michael Marmot for his continued support for the work being progressed in Manchester and for attending the meeting. She further thanked the Director of Public Health, the Deputy Director of Public Health and all staff involved in this work. She further stated that she would be attending the Making Manchester Fairer Conference on Monday 31 October 2022.

Decision

The Committee recommend that the Executive Member for Healthy Manchester and Adult Social Care organise a coalition of voices event, hosted in Manchester by the Mayor of Greater Manchester to invite and challenge the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care on the issue of health inequalities.

HSC/22/99 Update on Edenfield

The Chair introduced this item of business by stating that following the recent Panorama programme, where an undercover reporter had filmed inside the hospital showing disturbing and upsetting scenes, a senior representative from the Greater Manchester Mental Health Trust had been invited to the meeting to address the Committee.

In addition, the Committee would hear from the Council's Executive Director of Adult Social Services and Interim Deputy Place Based Lead, Manchester Locality.

The Chair further explained that the role of Health Scrutiny Committee was to consider how the Council and its partners in the NHS delivered health and social care services to improve the health and wellbeing of Manchester residents. The Committee could make recommendations about how they could improve these services.

The Chair advised that for anyone concerned about the care they were receiving or someone they cared for or has been affected by the issues raised in the BBC Panorama programme, they should not hesitate to contact the dedicated free helpline on 0808 175 3323. This was a confidential service staffed by trained and skilled practitioners who would be able to offer advice and support.

For completeness the statements are provided in full below:

Statement from the Deputy Chief Executive, Greater Manchester Mental Health Trust

Thank you for inviting me to speak to the Committee.

As you will no doubt be aware, the issues I'm about to speak to are extremely sensitive and are also subject to a number of ongoing investigations, including by Greater Manchester Police. As these proceedings are being live streamed and public, I therefore have to be cautious in what I can say to you today. I'm sure you will have questions and I will come on to how you can raise these formally, through our Programme Management Office, as I conclude.

By way of context

The Edenfield Centre is a secure hospital unit which provides inpatient treatment on our Prestwich site. Edenfield is approximately 1 mile away from the Trust HQ, situated near Phillips Park and Waterdale Meadow. The Centre has 12 wards within the secure perimeter, with around 160 inpatient beds and 600 staff.

On the afternoon of 8 September 2022, the BBC first informed us in writing that Panorama had conducted secret filming at Edenfield earlier this year (between March and June). They provided detailed information which listed a number of allegations about behaviours witnessed during their undercover filming – not of all which, we were told, would be broadcast. We formally requested to view the footage, but the BBC refused access to the programme in advance of broadcast.

However, we immediately notified Greater Manchester Police and Bury Safeguarding (who had also received a letter) and used the written allegations to take immediate action to protect patients.

At that point, it was clear that the BBC were alleging poor provision of services at the Edenfield Centre, including inappropriate or neglectful behaviour and a toxic staff culture. The information provided in advance by the BBC related to approximately 40 patients and approximately 25 staff.

We immediately recognised the seriousness of the allegations and set about taking immediate action. From a practical point of view, a Daily Executive Management Team was set up, chaired by Professor Craig Harris (deployed in from NHS Greater Manchester), who also took on the role of Programme Director for the newly created Programme Management Office. Our first and immediate priority was to ensure patient safety, so we acted quickly to:

- Conduct detailed, senior clinical reviews of all the affected patients to ensure their safety*
- Put in place additional advocacy support for patients, their carers and their families*
- Deploy additional senior clinical and operational management to the Edenfield Centre to ensure that appropriate working practices are being followed – some of our most experienced and senior staff from other areas were redeployed to the centre itself*
- Close the Edenfield Centre to new admissions and close a number of beds*
- We also suspended a significant number of staff, without prejudice, pending investigations – I'll return to this point in a moment.*
- And we commissioned an independent clinical review of the Edenfield Centre, led by Dr David Fearnley (Chief Medical Officer at Lancashire & South Cumbria NHS Foundation Trust).*

We anticipate that this review will present its findings to the Trust Board at the end of this month.

On the day of broadcast, 28 September, we opened a new, confidential freephone helpline for people who were affected by the issues raised in Panorama or those who

wanted to report anything that they thought would be relevant to the investigations. Details of this, and other sources of support and routes for reporting crimes were published on the GMMH website – and publicised by partner organisations including Greater Manchester Police.

Partnership working has been absolutely central to our response. Straight away we established close, regular contact with local and national partner organisations including NHS England, the Ministry of Justice, NHS Greater Manchester (the Integrated Care Board), neighbouring mental health Trusts (such as Pennine Care) and the Bury Safeguarding Unit – all of this to ensure the safety of our services.

The CQC – who also received a letter from the BBC on 8 September and whose response was included alongside our own in the broadcast – have also been in contact frequently. You might have seen that the CQC have also been criticised in recent media reports on this matter. Last week, the BBC reported that the CQC noted “strong” leadership at the Edenfield Centre and only suspended its “good” rating of the Centre in September, after the BBC had given the CQC information arising from its secret filming.

Separately, Greater Manchester Police began an investigation into the allegations contained in the BBC programme. This is ongoing. We are working with GMP to see if further footage can be obtained from the BBC to ensure that we have covered every base in ensuring patient safety and taking forward the necessary remedial, including disciplinary, action that may be required. Between gathering the secret footage in March through June 2022, the BBC only first notified us two-to-three months later - on 8 September - of their findings and allegations.

The police assured us last week that there was no reason why their own investigation should prevent us from making progress with our internal disciplinary processes. I am sure you will understand that I cannot say much more than has already been published in partner briefings with regards to disciplinary processes at the present time - because I do not want to prejudice them in any way. We expect to have some more news on this matter very soon. Suffice to say, disciplinary procedures began immediately on receipt of the Panorama letter a month ago, and we are making rapid progress in this respect.

You will also no doubt appreciate that we have rightly been inundated with requests for information and assurance from multiple sources. Because of the nature of how the Edenfield Centre is commissioned, our patients come from across the Greater Manchester region and beyond. As such there are various routes of governance and assurance, and we are doing everything we can to ensure that all interested parties receive updates and information when we can share them.

This incident has, as you can imagine, put even more pressure on our limited capacity and resources – both from an operational and management perspective – but it’s safe to say that we have all been working tirelessly to do what is necessary to ensure our patients are safe and to put things right.

At this point, I should add a personal reflection. So let me be very clear: what we all saw on Panorama was utterly appalling and shocking. It was extremely uncomfortable to watch.

It's fair to say that this has been, without a doubt, the most challenging period in the Trust's history to date. Everyone has been shocked by the allegations and our colleagues were as horrified as everyone to view the programme. You only need a cursory glance at social media to see the kind of reaction from the public – and, unfortunately, some of our staff have been subject to a high level of abuse, which makes the duty of protecting our services and service users even more pressing. We have a responsibility to all our staff and service users to ensure a safe and proper working and therapeutic environment.

And it's important to recognise that, whilst Edenfield is part of GMMH, the Trust is extremely large, with over 6000 staff and serving 60,000 patients across multiple boroughs and many geographical sites. You may be aware of other challenges we are facing in our other services, not least in Manchester on which you were briefed by my colleagues at your last meeting. Arguably this speaks to the wider picture of the pressures on the NHS in general, and on mental health services in particular which has been widely reported in recent months, and in the aftermath of the pandemic. We are focused on improvement and recovery.

We do not believe that the behaviours depicted at the Edenfield Centre on BBC Panorama are reflective of the vast majority of our services, or our staff. But of course we are not complacent about this and we are all working extremely hard to ensure that no one ever experiences this kind of poor care within our services.

With that in mind, I must emphasise that we are in constant contact with partners across the system. And we are very grateful for the support, the challenge and the guidance we are receiving from local, regional and national stakeholders – including some in this room today.

Let me end by saying that we are wholeheartedly committed to doing whatever it takes to put right these wrongs – and to preventing them from happening again. Our Chief Executive, Neil Thwaite, has promised honesty, candour and transparency as we go forward. And through our relationships, with your Chair and with other colleagues across the council, we will continue to keep you updated on progress.

I unfortunately can't take questions. But if you do have any further questions please contact the Programme Management Office at progofficeEC@gmmh.nhs.uk

Thank you.

Statement from the Executive Director of Adult Social Services, Manchester City Council

Due to the significant serious nature of the concerns raised this incident is categorised as a safeguarding enquiry; this involves a coordinated response across GM Local Authorities. This is being led by the Director of Adult Social Services – Bury Council and the Bury Safeguarding Partnership with support from Manchester City

Council and other local authorities. An ongoing series of weekly directors' strategy meetings is taking place to monitor and coordinate interventions and work with partner agencies to ensure the safety of patients on the wards.

We have mobilised a team of Senior Social Workers who are in the process of undertaking multidisciplinary care and wellbeing reviews with patients. We have a small number of Manchester patients identified at present, but we are expecting this number to increase in the coming weeks and months.

We have provided guidance to our workforce including contact centre staff and front-line practitioners across our teams, to ensure that we can give information and advice to patients and families who may require our support. We have established systems and processes to capture all relevant incoming information that is relevant to the enquiry.

Statement from the Interim Deputy Place Based Lead, Manchester Locality

Edenfield was discussed at the meeting of the Manchester Partnership Board on Friday 7th October and the Chief Executive of Greater Manchester Mental Health Trust provided the Board with an update. NHS and social care partner organisations in Manchester are supporting the work to ensure that patient safety is prioritised in partnership with the NHS Greater Manchester Integrated Care Board.

Finally a copy of these statements will be circulated to members of the Committee after the meeting

Some of the key points that arose from the Committee's discussions were: -

- The Committee unanimously condemned the appalling treatment and abuse of vulnerable patients entrusted to the care of the Trust;
- The Panorama programme demonstrated a systemic failure at the Trust;
- The Committee could not be confident that these failings were isolated to the Edenfield Centre;
- The senior leadership at the Trust were ultimately accountable for the failings witnessed, describing what was reported as a catastrophic failure on behalf of the Trust;
- Noting that when the Trust had previously presented to the Committee they had portrayed themselves as making significant improvements in the care of patients, the Committee were of the opinion that this was evidently not correct and trust and confidence between the Committee and the Trust had been lost;
- The Trust needed to engage with and meet all patient groups, community activists, families and carers, and local Councillors to hear and respond to all concerns raised in regard to the care of patients;
- Members questioned the efficacy of the Trust's Whistleblowing Policy and the Trust needed to review these cases to consider any patterns that should have alerted management to issues within the organisation; and
- The Committee unanimously called for a Public Inquiry to consider the issues at Trust.

The Deputy Chief Executive, Greater Manchester Mental Health Trust replied by stating that the Trust and its Board accepted that they were ultimately responsible for the quality of service. He stated that he had listened to the views of the Committee and these, along with those of all stakeholders would be reflected upon and included in the improvement plan. He advised that the Committee would be kept informed of this work.

The Executive Member for Healthy Manchester and Adult Social Care stated that there was a duty to support all the victims and their families who had experienced abuse and neglect. He advised that he would be lobbying the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care to launch a Public Inquiry to consider the issues raised in the BBC programme.

Decision

The Committee recommend that the Executive Member for Healthy Manchester and Adult Social Care write to the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care to ask that a Public Inquiry is launched to examine the issues raised in the BBC programme.

HSC/22/100 Climate Change - Impact Of The Recent Heatwave

The Chair recommended that this item of business be deferred to the December meeting of the Committee. This recommendation was supported by the Committee.

Decision

To defer consideration of this item of business to the December meeting of the Committee.

HSC/22/101 Enabling Independence Accommodation Strategy (2022-2032)

The Committee considered the joint report of the Executive Director of Adult Social Services, the Strategic Director Growth & Development, the Strategic Lead for Commissioning, Children and Education and the Strategic Lead for Homelessness.

The report provided an update on the development of an Enabling Independence Accommodation Strategy for Manchester (2022-2032). Describing that its key aim was to improve housing with care and support options to meet people's needs and better enable their independence.

Key points and themes in the report included:

- Providing an introduction and background;
- Describing that this was a partnership strategy, developed between Adults, Children's, Homelessness, Strategic Housing and Manchester Housing Providers' Partnership (MHPP) provider;
- The strategy was the product of an extensive consultation, with both internal and external key stakeholders;
- Describing the four key objectives of the strategy; and
- Next steps.

Some of the key points that arose from the Committee's discussions were: -

- Planning policy needed to include a requirement for developers to ensure all new build homes were adaptable in the future;
- Recognising the need and challenge to engage with the Private Rented Sector on this issue;
- Noting the importance for people to remain in their homes so they could remain connected to their community and support networks; and
- The need to consider the support offered to older residents who were owner occupiers and had limited resources.

The Deputy Director Adult Social Services informed the Committee that people were at the heart of Strategy, adding that it was recognised that housing was a significant contribution to a person's health and wellbeing. She further made reference to the report 'Extra Care Growth and Developments in Manchester' that had been considered at the Committee's June meeting, that had described the activities to support residents to right size and remain in or close to their community. She further commented that the Better Outcomes Better Lives programme would also support people to remain in their homes where appropriate.

In regard to the issue of new developments the Head of Housing Services stated that developers were challenged on the issue of future adaptability, however it was often an issue of affordability for developers. He stated as the Council developed and sought to approve the Local Plan this would be an opportunity to consider if this should be included as a planning condition. He further noted the comments from the Committee in regard to the challenge presented by the Private Rented Sector on this issue. In response to a comment raised regarding the Housing Allocations Policy he stated that this had been amended in November 2020 and a report on the outcome of the policy changes would be considered by the Economy Scrutiny Committee in the new year. It was noted that if the Council decided that it wanted to review the policy again this could take approximately 2 years based on the previous review.

Guy Cresswell, Executive Director, Great Places Housing Group spoke on behalf of Manchester Housing Providers' Partnership. He stated that the strategy was fully endorsed by the Partnership. He stated that the Partnership supported the evidenced based strategy and welcomed the whole system approach to deliver the best outcomes for Manchester residents.

Decision

The Committee agree that the final version of the Enabling Independence Accommodation Strategy (2022-2032) be taken for consideration by the Executive in November 2022.

HSC/22/102 Overview Report

The report of the Governance and Scrutiny Support Unit which contained key decisions within the Committee's remit and responses to previous recommendations

was submitted for comment. Members were also invited to agree the Committee's future work programme.

Appended to the report for information was the Manchester Autumn and Winter Vaccination Plan 2022-3.

Decision

The Committee notes the report and agrees the work programme.